

DOCTORAL DISSERTATION

**THE APOCALYPTIC HORIZON IN BYZANTIUM:
PHILOSOPHY, PROPHECY, AND POLITICS DURING THE ELEVENTH
THROUGH THIRTEENTH CENTURIES**

BY

ANDRÁS KRAFT

SUPERVISOR: ISTVÁN PERCZEL

SUBMITTED TO
THE MEDIEVAL STUDIES DEPARTMENT, AND
THE DOCTORAL SCHOOL OF HISTORY
CENTRAL EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY, BUDAPEST, HUNGARY

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN MEDIEVAL STUDIES, AND
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN HISTORY

BUDAPEST

2018

szüleimnek

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IV
LIST OF FIGURES	VI
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	VI
<i>PERIODICALS</i> AND SERIES	vi
PART I: PHILOSOPHICAL SOURCES	viii
PART II: APOCALYPTIC SOURCES	xi
PART III: HISTORIOGRAPHICAL / PATRIOGRAPHIC SOURCES	xiii
PROLEGOMENA	1
PART I. ARGUING THE END: THE PHILOSOPHICAL HERITAGE IN THE DEFENSE OF ESCHATOLOGY	10
CHAPTER 1: THE ETERNALIST DEBATE FROM LATE ANTIQUITY UNTIL THE ELEVENTH CENTURY	11
CHAPTER 2: JOHN ITALOS ON THE ETERNALIST DEBATE	20
THE LIFE AND WORK OF JOHN ITALOS	20
TEXT AND TRANSLATION OF ITALOS' QUAESTIO 71	24
INDEX VERBORUM AD RES PHILOSOPHICAS SPECTANTIUM	42
COMMENTARY ON ITALOS' QUAESTIO 71	44
REFUTING ARISTOTLE: THE ARGUMENT FROM INFINITY (ARG. I.1)	45
REFUTING PROKLOS: THE PARADIGM ARGUMENT (ARG. I.2)	48
CREATION THROUGH AN ACT OF THE DIVINE WILL INVOLVES THE TEMPORALITY OF THE WORLD (ARG. I.3)	49
THE MATERIALITY OF THE WORLD ENTAILS ITS CORRUPTIBILITY (ARG. I.4)	51
REFUTING THE THEORY OF TWO TYPES OF MATTER (ARG. I.5)	56
REFUTING THE NOTION THAT THERE CAN BE NO OTHER WORLD AFTER THE PRESENT ONE (ARG. I.7)	58
THE WORLD TO COME WILL BE FORMALLY IDENTICAL WITH THE PRESENT WORLD (ARG. II.1)	59
AFFIRMING THAT THIS WORLD WILL END AND WILL BE TRANSFORMED (ARG. II.2)	60
DEVELOPING THE IMPLICATIONS OF A CORRUPTIBLE WORLD (EPILOGUE TO THE EMPEROR)	61
THE SIGNIFICANCE OF ITALOS' QUAESTIO 71	63
CHAPTER 3: THE ETERNALIST DEBATE IN THE TWELFTH AND THIRTEENTH CENTURIES	70
PART II. NARRATING THE END: THE NARRATOLOGY AND TYPOLOGY OF THE END TIMES	78
CHAPTER 4: THE CHRONOLOGY OF APOCALYPTIC TIME	80
END-TIME CALCULATIONS	81
NARRATIVE SEQUENCES	84
CHAPTER 5: TEXTUAL VELOCITY AND TEMPORAL ANOMALIES	88
NARRATIVE SPEED	88
SHORTENING OF DAYS	91
CHAPTER 6: TYPOLOGICAL STRUCTURES	95
MASSACRE OF THE INNOCENTS TYPOLOGY	97
EXODUS TYPOLOGY	99
AHAB TYPOLOGY	101
ANTEDILUVIAN TYPOLOGY	104
CHRISTOLOGICAL TYPOLOGIES	105
SAVIOR-EMPEROR	105
ANTICHRIST	112
CHAPTER 7: INFERENCES WITH REGARD TO APOCALYPTIC TIME	118

PART III. UTILIZING THE END: APPROPRIATIONS OF THE APOCALYPTIC HORIZON FOR POLITICAL USE	124
CHAPTER 8: THE APOCALYPTIC PROFILE OF ALEXIOS I KOMNĒNOS	126
CLAIMING THE MANTLE OF THE LAST EMPEROR	127
KALLIKLĒS' TESTIMONY OF THE LAST JUDGMENT DEPICTION	134
POLITICAL RAMIFICATIONS OF THE APOCALYPTIC HORIZON	139
CHAPTER 9: THE EXECUTION OF ALEXIOS V DOUKAS MOURTZOUPHLOS	143
THE APOCALYPTIC CONTEXT OF THE COLUMN OF THEODOSIOS	146
THE ORACULAR CONTEXT OF THE EXECUTION	150
REACTIONS TO THE EXECUTION IN THIRTEENTH-CENTURY APOCALYPTICISM	156
CHAPTER 10: BYZANTINE IRREDENTISM IN THE THIRTEENTH CENTURY	164
EDITION AND TRANSLATION OF AN ANEPIGRAPHIC PROPHETIC CHRONICLE (s. XII ^{EX} /XIII ^{IN})	168
CHŌNIATĒS' TYPOLOGICAL STRATEGY	174
THE HORIZON OF IMPERIAL IRREDENTISM	177
CONCLUSION	180
BIBLIOGRAPHY	185
APPENDIX. AN INVENTORY OF MEDIEVAL GREEK APOCALYPTIC SOURCES (C. 500–1500 AD)	227
ABBREVIATIONS	231
INDEX OF SURVEYED MATERIAL	233
LITERATURE CITED	282
APPENDIX: STATISTICAL ANALYSIS	305

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is my most pleasant duty to wholeheartedly thank my supervisor, István Perczel, whose brilliance and patience guided me through years of doctoral research. His Platonic genius and biblical literacy greatly improved the present thesis. I also owe a debt of gratitude to Aziz al-Azmeh, who mentored me through parts of my studies. While carrying out research in Greece, I was taken under the wings of Alexandros Alexakis and Christos Simelidis respectively. I wish to acknowledge my sincere gratitude to all four of my supervisors.

I would also like to thank Wolfram Brandes, Michael Grünbart, Katerina Ierodiakonou, Paul Magdalino, and George Zografidis for their constructive feedback on sections of my thesis. Ioannis Melinos of the Patmos Monastery and Monk Theologos of the Iviron Monastery have tirelessly and most kindly assisted me in the search for manuscripts containing Medieval Greek apocalypica. I truly appreciate their help. My heartfelt thanks also go to Panagiotis C. Athanasopoulos, Stefanos Dimitriadis, Florin Filimon, James Hart, Renan M. Liparotti, Nikos Livanos, Dionysios A. Mamagkakis, Dimitris Minasidis, and Joshua Robinson. Moreover, I am grateful for the cordial patronage and assistance shown by Evangelos Chrysos, Paolo Odorico, Agamemnon Tselikas as well as by Constantin Genigeorgis.

This dissertation would not have been possible without the support of a number of academic institutions. The *Central European University* with its Medieval Studies Department and Center for Eastern Mediterranean Studies has funded and supported much of my research. While in Greece, I received generous sponsorship from the *Alexander S. Onassis Public Benefit Foundation* and the *Greek State Scholarship Foundation* (IKY). Furthermore, I also received invaluable support from Koç University's *Research Center for Anatolian Civilizations*, from the *Tsakopoulos Hellenic Library* at the California State University, Sacramento, and from the *Sonderforschungsbereich 1150* at the University of Münster. Finally, I am thankful for the support that I received at the *American University of Central Asia*, where I have completed this dissertation.

Various chapters of the thesis are slight revisions of papers that have recently been published or are currently in press. CHAPTER 2 is a slight revision of a paper that I co-authored with my supervisor I. Perczel, entitled: “John Italos on the Eternity of the World,” *BZ* 111/3 (2018): 659–720. CHAPTERS 4–7 are based on the following publications of mine: “Living on the Edge of Time: Temporal Patterns and Irregularities in Byzantine Historical Apocalypses,” in *The Fascination with Unknown Time*, ed. S. Baumbach, L. Henningsen, K. Oschema (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 71–91; “Miracles and Pseudo-Miracles in Byzantine Apocalypses,” in *Recognizing Miracles in Antiquity and Beyond*, ed. M. Gerolemou, Trends in Classics, Supplementary Volumes 53 (Berlin/Boston, MA: Walter de Gruyter, 2018), 111–130; “Typological Hermeneutics and Apocalyptic Time: A Case Study of the Medieval Greek Last Vision of the Prophet Daniel,” in *Όψεις του Βυζαντινού Χρόνου. Πρακτικά Διεθνούς Συνεδρίου, Αθήνα, 29–30 Μαΐου 2015*, ed. E. Saradē, A. Dellaporta, Th. Kollyropoulou (Kalamata: Πανεπιστήμιο Πελοποννήσου/Χριστιανικό και Βυζαντινό Μουσείο, 2018), 180–194. CHAPTER 9 is largely identical with the forthcoming publication: “Prophecies as a resource of decision-making: The case of Alexios V Doukas Mourtzouphlos’ execution at the Column of Theodosios,” in *Supporting sovereign decision-making: Experts and their knowledge in a transcultural and comparative perspective*, ed. M. Grünbart (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, forthcoming). The APPENDIX has been published in: “An inventory of Medieval Greek apocalyptic sources (c. 500–1500 AD): Naming and dating, editions and manuscripts,” *Millennium* 15 (2018): 69–143.

The whole thesis will be made available on <https://sierra.ceu.edu/record=b1410836>